

**New York City Department of  
Education**

**Citywide Council on  
English Language Learners (CCELL)**

**Annual Report**

**July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2019**

**Prepared by: Carolyn Prager**

**Assisted by: Mitchel Wu, President, CCELL**  
**Teresa Arboleda, Past President, CCELL**  
**Nargiza Rafieva, Member**  
**Julie Zhu, Member**

## Table of Contents

Sections	Pages
<b>I. Introduction, Mission, and Goals</b>	1-2
· Mission	1
· Goals	2
<b>II. Context: New York City Public School ELL Population and Programs</b>	3-9
· ELL Student Population	3
· Name and Terminology	3
· Enrollment	4
· ELL Place of Birth and Home Language	4
· ‘Other’ Category in DOE Demographic Report	6
· ELL Graduation Rates and Postsecondary Participation After High School Graduation	6
· ELL State Common Core, SAT, and Other Test Results	8
· English Language Arts (ELA)	8
· Math	8
· SAT and other State or National Test or Standard	8
· Summary Table	9
· New York City Public School Program Categories	9
<b>III. CCELL Creation and Composition</b>	10-13
· State Intervention into NYC ELL Education	10
· Governance of NYC Educational Programs and Policies	10
· Creation of Citywide Community Education Councils	10
· Early Membership Challenges	11
· Organization and Bylaws	12
· Office Location and Administrative Support	13
<b>IV. CCELL Advocacy</b>	14-15
· Bilingual/Dual Language Program Expansion and Funding	14
· DACA/Dream Act and Other Programs Impacting Service for ELL Students	15
<b>V. Building Connections: Communication and Outreach</b>	16-21
· Translation and Interpretation Services, Strategies, and Implementation	16
· CCELL Digital Outreach—Website and Social Media	16
· CCELL Logo and Other Promotion	17
· Connecting to Others by Fostering Council Relationship with the Community	17
· Relationship with Elected and Appointed Officials and Other Official Bodies	18
· Presentations of Others To the CCELL, 2017-2019	19
· Presentations by CCELL Members to Others in the Communities They Serve	20

## Table of Contents

<b>VI. Professional Development: Education and Training</b>	22
· Education Initiatives	22
· Training Initiatives	22
<b>VII. Strategic Planning and Recommendations</b>	23-24
· Strategic Planning	23
· Recommendation	24
<b>VII. Ten Years: Representing the Multilingual Community</b>	25
<b>Attachment:</b> Memorandum of Understanding	26-38

## I. Introduction, Mission, and Goals

This report covers two academic years, 2017-18 and 2018-19. During this period, the New York City Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) fulfilled its important mission to promote English language learning by advocating on behalf of New York City public school students in bilingual, dual language, and English as a new language (ENL) programs. During the 2017-2019 period covered by this report, the Council responded to changes and challenges impacting the education of English Language Learners (ELLs).

Through its several initiatives, the Council also solidified progress made during its formative academic years 2013-2014, during 2014-2015, and during 2016-2017. As a result, Council activity in the period covered by this Annual Report for 2017-2019 was enabled by the work done by the Council in the preceding years. That groundwork led to a more stable, more inclusive, and more productive Council better positioned to carry out its stated mission. The results included but were not limited to changes in Council membership and structure for which the Council was directly or indirectly responsible, such as important changes in State Education Law that helped to stabilize Council membership, thereby providing for better continuity and stability.

Council service is a voluntary unpaid commitment from individuals with employment, childcare, and/or other demands on their time. The service of each CCELL member requires significant commitment from those who have other demands on their time and energy. By law, CCELL membership includes parents as well as other community representatives, including a non-voting student. Their participation enriches the Council's work. It brings diverse experience and perspectives as parents, students, and community members to bear on New York City public school ELL programs and services.

Implementation of the mission and goals of the NYC Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) continues to evolve within context of the City's response to the needs of its English Language Learner (ELL) population. As an advisory body to the New York City Department of Education (NYCDOE), to the Chancellor, and to the Mayor, the CCELL must balance its time between engagement with the ELL public education community as well as its engagement with elected and appointed officials and bodies influencing educational programs and policies that have direct or indirect bearing on ELL policies, programs and services.

### **CCELL Mission**

The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) promotes English language learning by advocating on behalf of New York City public school students in Transitional Bilingual (TB), Dual Language (DL), and ENL programs. (ENL, English as a New Language, has replaced the older term ESL (English as a Second Language). This Report will use either or both terms, as used by sources.) The Council also encourages parent engagement in their children's language learning. It provides information about public school ELL programs and services and provides a forum for parents and community to air concerns about these programs and services.

## CCELL Goals

In June 2019, The Citywide Council on English Language Learners (CCELL) established three broad goals in an update to the original 2013-2015 Plan. (See the CCELL website link at [https://8c2ea5a1-747c-4e07-910f-44ee995fba8.filesusr.com/ugd/c70824\\_6ca0b112516d4baf9a370e8e8ae1420f.pdf](https://8c2ea5a1-747c-4e07-910f-44ee995fba8.filesusr.com/ugd/c70824_6ca0b112516d4baf9a370e8e8ae1420f.pdf) in the “About Us” menu on the Council’s website [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org). (See **additional links to documents posted on the CCELL Website throughout this Report**)

The CCELL articulated the three broad goals to guide the development of strategies that would enable the Council to fulfill its mission of service to the ELL school population and their communities through:

1. **Organization and structure**, including reaching and maintaining full Council membership.
2. **Communication and outreach**, through development of its website and other resources for parents and the community.
3. **Professional development** for new and continuing members and staff.

These goals continued to inform the Council’s implementation of its mission during the period covered by this Annual Report. The CCELL continued to develop strategies and implement activities to fulfill these goals as documented in its 2015-2017 Annual Report and in this one for 2017-2019. (See the full 2015-2017 Report text at: [https://8c2ea5a1-747c-4e07-910f-d44ee995fba8.filesusr.com/ugd/c70824\\_62bdea43af1b4decb4e52a1364e134f9.pdf](https://8c2ea5a1-747c-4e07-910f-d44ee995fba8.filesusr.com/ugd/c70824_62bdea43af1b4decb4e52a1364e134f9.pdf) in the “About Us” menu on the Council’s website at: [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org). “The About Us” section also contains all CCELL Annual Reports from 2011 on.)

In the previous 2013-2015 Annual Report, the CCELL had assessed progress carrying out the Strategic Plan’s goals. Based on this assessment, it made six recommendations for continued progress. A substantial portion of this 2017-2019 Report documents the CCELL’s progress implementing the six recommendations:

1. Committee Structure Implementation (see Section III: CCELL Creation and Composition, below).
2. Education and Training of Members and Staff (see Section VI, Professional Development: Education and Training, below).
3. Expansion of ELL Program Range and Reach (see Section IV, CCELL Advocacy, below).
4. Provision of Free English Classes for ELL Parents (see Section VI, Building Connections: Communication and Outreach, below).
5. Provision of Interpretation and Translation Services for ELL Parents at Department of Education Meetings and Events (see Section VI, Building Connections: Communication and Outreach, below).
6. Supporting Adequate State Funding (see Section IV, CCELL Advocacy, below).

## II. Context: New York City Public School ELL Population and Programs

New York State law requires that any student who "by reason of foreign birth or ancestry who speaks a language other than English, and either understands and speaks little or no English, or who has been identified by any English language assessment instrument approved by the commissioner as a pupil of limited English proficiency, shall receive a program of bilingual education or English as a New Language (ENL) in accordance with standards established by the commissioner." (Source: New York State Education Department, "Key Laws and Regulations: Section 3204," at <http://www.p12.nysed.gov/sss/lawsregs/3204.html>.)

### ELL Student Population

This Report will use data available from City and State official demographic reports. Some differences in ELL numbers for the same or similar items may occur in different portions of this Report, depending the sources and methodology used by those compiling the data sources. For example, the *English Language Learner Demographics Report for the 2016-17 School Year* from the Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) of the NYC Department of Education (DOE) explains that differences in ELL numbers in that Report may have resulted from its use of both the NYC DOE's annual ELL survey and its Audited Register "because the latter is a snapshot in time, while the former looks at all ELLs who came in and out of the NYC DOE" (Appendix I, p. 45).

**Names and Terminology:** The DOE reports for the 2016-2017 and for the 2018-2019 school years will each be cited as the *Demographic Report or Demographic Reports* in the following portions of this CCELL Annual Report.

*As of January 2019, the Department of Education's Division of English Language and Student Support Services (DELSS) name changed to that of the Division of Multilingual Learners (DML). Because of overlap in name changes during the two academic years covered in this Annual Report, the DELLSS and/or the DML will be referred to as the DELLSS/DML in the following sections of this Report, where appropriate. DELLSS representatives renamed as those from DML in January 2019, regularly attended monthly public meetings of the CCELL to provide information and guidance to the members and attendees.*

*Similarly, some official reports continue to use the older nomenclature ESLs or ELLs for English as a Second Language Learners or English Language Learners while others use the newer term ENLs for English as a New Language Learners. When citing data, this Report will use the terminology cited by the respective data reports.*

*It should also be noted that when a reference is made to CCELL resolutions or documents, these can be accessed at the CCELL website: [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org).*

**Enrollments:** According to the 2016-2017 *Report*, 160,624 students were enrolled in NYC public schools “at some point” (p. 5) during the 2016-2017 school year. ELLs then accounted for 14.7% percent of the overall New York City public school population. According to the 2018-2019 *Report*, 154,276 were enrolled, a decline of over 5,000. During the 2016-17 school year per that *Report*, over half (55.57%) of all ELLs in NYC DOE were in elementary school grades (89,252). Kindergarten through second grade had the highest number of ELLs (17,240, 17,076, and 17,899, respectively) while third through fifth grade had fewer. ELL status is not as static as race or gender, which probably accounts for why there were fewer ELLs in the later elementary grades. As students become proficient in English and pass the NYSESLAT, they are no longer identified as ELLs. Over a quarter (26.36%) of all ELLs were in high school grades (42,337). Ninth grade showed the highest concentration of ELLs (14,244), “potentially signaling a major entry point for recently arrived ELLs” (p. 6).

During the 2018-2019 school year, a little over half (53.49%) of all ELLs were also enrolled in elementary school grades (82,517). Kindergarten through second grade had the highest numbers of ELLs (15,901, 14,829, and 14,814, respectively) with fewer ELLs in third through fifth grade. The DOE suggests “One reason there may be fewer ELLs in the later elementary grades is that the ELL status is not a static student characteristic like race or gender. As students become proficient in English and pass the NYSESLAT, they are no longer identified as ELLs”, (p. 7 of that *Report*). Over a quarter (27.78%) of all ELLs were in high school grades (42,860). Ninth grade showed the highest concentration with 13,842 ELLs, which the DOE suggests “potentially” that ninth grade signals a major entry point for recently arrived ELLs.

**ELL Places of Birth and Home Languages:** *The English Language Learner Demographic Report for the 2016-2017 School Year* also notes that for the first time in several years, the majority of ELL’s (51.48%) were not born in the USA. Foreign-born ELLs were clustered more in some boroughs and districts than others. For example, Brooklyn had 29.5%, Queens and the Bronx 28.73% and 26.91% respectively, but Manhattan only 12.93% and Staten Island only 1.78% respectively. Converted to rational numbers, however, 12.93% equals 10,694 students, still a significant number (p. 13).

According to the DOE’s *Demographic Report* for 2016-2017:

- 22.37% of ELLs were born in the Dominican Republic, Honduras, or El Salvador;
- 6.05% were born in China; and
- 3.37% were born in Yemen, 3.15% in Bangladesh, 1.84% in Uzbekistan, and 1.68% in Haiti.

According to recent DOE 2018-2019 data at <https://www.schools.nyc.gov/about-us/reports/doe-data-at-a-glance>, 40.6% percent of enrolled students are now Hispanic, 25.5 percent Black, 16.2 percent Asian, and 15.1 percent Other. 119,551 students were in charter schools, which are also required to offer ELL/ENL programs. Although the data for 2016-2017 and 2018-2019 were compiled somewhat differently, the figures suggest fluid shifting of demographic patterns in terms of countries of origin and language groups between 2016-2017 and 2018-2019.

The following table for ELL birthplace is based the on most recent data published by the DOE in the 2018-2019 *Demographic Report*.

<b>Top 10 ELL Places of Birth 2018-2019 Number and Percent of Total ELL Population Citywide New York City Public Schools</b>			
	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Number of ELLs</b>	<b>Percent of ELLs</b>
1	USA	71,852	46.57%
2	Dominican Republic	27,216	17.64%
3	China	8,339	5.41%
4	Yemen	4,944	3.20%
5	Bangladesh	4,316	2.80%
6	Ecuador	3,938	2.55%
7	Honduras	3,387	2.20%
8	Uzbekistan	2,945	1.91%
9	Guatemala	2,691	1.74%
10	Haiti	2,491	1.61%
11	Other	22,157	14.36%
<b>Total</b>	<b>All Places of Birth</b>	<b>154,276</b>	<b>100.00%</b>

The following tables summarize the percentage distribution of ELL home languages spoken by the 10 largest ELL populations according to the DOE for 2016-2017 and for 2018-2019. Absolute numbers and percentages have shifted to some extent among language groups. For example, compared to the NYCDOE's 2013-2014 data, for the 2017-2018 academic year, the Arabic speaker ELL population increased more than a percentage point to 5.34% from 4.2%, the Chinese decreased from 14.2% to 13.39%, and the Haitian Creole public school population decreased from 2.3% to 1.88%. (Source: New York City Department of Education, Division of English Language Learners and Student Support, *English Language Learner Demographics Report for the 2016-17 School Year*, pp. 19-20).

During the 2018-2019 school year, ELLs in New York City spoke 154 languages other than English. They spoke a home language of Spanish (61.23%), nearly five times those who spoke the second most common Chinese (12.44%). ELLs with a home language of Spanish or Chinese accounted for nearly three-fourths of the entire ELL population. However, ELLs with Arabic as their home language of Arabic (5.99%), of Bengali (4.06%), and of Russian (2.63%) still

translate into significant numbers, ranging from over 9,000 Arabic speakers to over 4,000 Russian and Bengali speakers, respectively.

<b>Top 10 ELL Home Languages 2016-2017 and 2018-2019 Number and Percent of Total ELL Population Citywide New York City Public Schools</b>		
Language	Number of ELLs 2016-2017/2018-2019	Percent of ELLs 2016-2017/2018-2019
Spanish	97,299/94,460	60.58/ 61.23
Chinese (various)	21,438/19,191	13.35/12.44
Arabic	9,712/9,235	6.05/5.99
Bengali	7,020/6,266	4.37/ 4.06
Russian	3,805/4,063	2.37/2.63
Urdu	3,159/2,793	1.97 /1.85
Haitian Creole	3,079/2,851	1.92/1.81
French	1,952/1,929	1.22/1.25
Uzbek	1,585/1,764	.99/ 1.14
Punjabi	1,081/1,120	.67/ .73
Other	10,494/10,604	6.53/6.87
<b>Total</b>	<b>160,624/154,276</b>	<b>100.00</b>

#### **“OTHER” Category in DOE Demographic Reports**

The DOE’s cited *Demographic Reports* only break out data for the 10 largest ELL language groups. All other ENL students are aggregated in the “Other” category. It should be noted that the “Other” category still contains a significant number of students. For example, there were 10,494 students designated as “Other” in the 2016-2017 Report and 10,604 in the 2018-2019 Report. This limits somewhat certain aspects of the data’s utility since it does not break out numbers for other language groups with numbers that may have implication for the provision of ELL teaching and services by the NYC public school system.

#### **ELL Graduation Rates and Postsecondary Participation After High School Graduation**

It should also be noted that the DOE’s cited *Demographic Reports* and other data sources do not provide graduation rates or postsecondary participation for ELLs after high school graduation. Such data would be of interest to the CCELL and the community it represents. For example, are the graduation rates and postsecondary participation rates for certain language groups higher or lower than for others? If so, what are the implications for the provision of ELL teaching and services?

Many former and current ELL learners have excelled and continue to excel academically. The data cited below includes global statewide 2018-2019 graduation rates and statewide exam data for New York State as a whole for multilingual and ELL students. These data can be found at [http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/bilingual-ed/nysed\\_ell\\_mll\\_data-report\\_2018-2019-a.pdf](http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/bilingual-ed/nysed_ell_mll_data-report_2018-2019-a.pdf).) This Report also includes data for a somewhat earlier period to demonstrate ELL learner academic success.

As would be expected for new language learners, for example for 2015-2017, the NYC ELL population overall had a lower graduation rate than the general NYC public school population because of more limited English proficiency and less exposure to the English language. For then current and former English language learners combined who entered NYC high schools in 2011, 50.2% graduated by August 2015, compared with 70.5% for all members of that year's high school graduation cohort. For those ELLs entering in 2012, 50.8% of ELLs graduated in August 2016 compared to 72.6% for the total cohort.

(Sources: New York City Department of Education, *New York City Graduation Rates Class of 2017 (2013 Cohort)*, <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/7A600EF5-571F-4D96-B0DA><http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/7A600EF5-571F-4D96-B0DA-35F36416C9F2/0/2017GraduationRatesWebDeck2618.pdf>35F36416C9F2/0/2017GraduationRatesWebDeck2618.pdf. See also Excel file with more detailed data breakdown at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/Accountability/data/GraduationDropoutReports/default.htm>.)

General graduation cohorts are based on those who had started 9<sup>th</sup> grade four years earlier. Thus, the 2015 graduation cohort was defined as those who had started 9<sup>th</sup> grade in 2011. The 2016 graduation cohort was based on those who had started 9<sup>th</sup> grade in 2012. The graduation percentages for current and former ELLs combined stayed relatively steady. (Students are considered former ELLs if classified as ELLs in the last two school years.) Understandably, those classified as former ELLs had a significantly higher graduation rate than those classified as current ELLs. In 2016, more students became former ELLs. 84.1% of former ELLs graduated in 2016 compared to 30.8% of current ELLs. **This is one indication of the positive impact of ELL education on their success rate.**

In August 2015 and 2016, graduation figures were somewhat higher than for previous years. In January 2015, the New York State Board of Regents slightly eased the graduation requirements for English language learners for some who had arrived in the United States already as high school students. These students were now eligible to graduate if they had received a score of 55 or higher on the English language arts Regents instead of a previous 62. Such students would also have had to meet other requirements like good attendance and passing three other, Regents exams with scores of at least 65.

In general, since 2009 and 2019, ELL graduation rates mostly though not always, increased year over year. For the 2019 graduating class, the aggregate graduation rate for current and former ELL learners increased between 2018 and 2019 by another 4.3% overall, by 6.2% for current ELLs and by 2.4% for former ELLs. **This is another indicator of the positive impact of ELL/ENL education on students' academic success** (see <https://infohub.nyced.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2019-graduation-rates---website---1-16-20.pdf>.)

### **ELL State Common Core, SAT, and Other Test Result**

NYC student improvement on statewide tests, especially the ELA, owes something to factors such as changing demographics. The ELA or English Language Arts test is a NYS exam administered to grades 3-8). However, ELL student improvement on such tests still indicates the positive effects on the quality and quantity of NYC public school ELL programs and services made during this period in response to the State initiated 2014 *Memorandum of Understanding* that required New York City to expand and improve ELL programs and services (see further Section III, below, and Attachment A for text of and importance of the *Memorandum*).

**English Language Arts (ELA):** Not surprisingly, ELLs are typically more constrained by language on standardized English tests than on math tests. Statewide, 39.8% of all students combined in grades 3-8 scored at levels 3+4 on the State English Language Arts (ELA) Spring 2017 exams but only 4% of current ELLs. More recent data since 2017 compiled by the NYCDOE shows a slight decrease in the ELA proficiency rate of “current” ELLs since 2018 and a slight increase for “ever” ELLs and “never” ELLs (see table below).

The following table disaggregates data by multilingual learner status. “Current” English Language Learners are English Language Learners during the testing year. “Ever” English Language Learners are students identified as English Language Learners any year prior to the testing year but not including the testing year. “Never” English Language Learners are students who were never identified as an English Language Learner.

**Math:** For math, 40.2% of all students statewide scored at proficiency levels 3+4 in 2017. However, 46.8% of NYC “ever” ELLs scored at this level, almost 7% higher than the statewide average. Still, only 13.2% of “current” ELLs scored at this proficiency level. **This suggests the possibility that longer exposure to ELL education and English language use has a positive effect on academic achievement, even on such supposedly language neutral subjects as math.** Going forward, this suggests another area for further research.

### **SAT and Other State or National Tests or Standards:**

- **SAT.** NYC started administering the SAT to all 11<sup>th</sup> graders in 2017 but had not disaggregated data by ELLs as of this Annual Report. Record-high 63,499 seniors took the SAT exam by the end of high school in 2018, an increase of 25 percent over the previous year. The increase was partially driven by SAT School Day, first offered in spring of 2017, when all high school juniors can take the SAT for free at school. Going forward, the growth of SAT population may merit inclusion of disaggregated ELLs.
- **Regents and Advanced Placement.** A record-high 55,001 students took at least one Advanced Placement exam in 2018, a rise of 11.4 percent since the previous year. Over the last five years, there has been a 55.3 percent increase. ELL data are also for Regents and Advanced Placement results are available for ELLs by school (follow the link to Regents at <https://infohub.nyced.org/reports/academics/test-results>).

- **NAEP.** Each year, a sample of New York City schools participates in the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) Trial Urban District Assessments. However, NAEP results are only available at the citywide level without disaggregated ELL.

**Summary Table:** The following table summarizes New York City ELL student results on New York State proficiency exams given in Spring 2016 though 2019 (<https://infohub.nyced.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2019-math-ela---website---8-22-19.pdf>). Please note that 2018 and 2019 results cannot be compared with total accuracy to prior years because in 2018 the NYSED rescaled the Math and ELA exams to account for a change in test administration from 3 days to 2 days.

<b>% Of Students Proficient in Grades 3-8 State Common Core English Language Arts and Math Tests New York City Ells Scores</b> <a href="https://infohub.nyced.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2019-math-ela---website---8-22-19.pdf">https://infohub.nyced.org/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2019-math-ela---website---8-22-19.pdf</a>					
	2016	2017	2018	2019	Percentage Point Change Since 2018
Current ELLS/ELA	4.0	5.2	9.9	9.3	-0.6
Ever ELLS/ELA	39.7	45.2	58.7	59.3	+0.5
Never ELLS/ELA	40.8	42.6	50.8	55.1	+0.7
Current ELLS/Math	11.5	13.2	18.0	18.9	+0.9
Ever ELLS/Math	43.6	46.8	57.2	61.1	+3.8
Never ELL/ Math	41.7	42.7	44.9	47.8	+2.9

### **NYC Public School ELL Program Categories and Enrollment Distribution**

The NYC Department of Education offers three kinds of ELL programs. Parents can choose from transitional bilingual (TBE), dual language (DL), or English as a New Language (ENL, formerly ESL) programs. During the 2016-17 school year per the *Demographic Report*, 83.07% of NYC ELLs were enrolled in ENL/ESL programs, 10,81% in TBE programs, and 4.91% in DL programs. A very small proportion of ELLs (1.2%) were either not served or their program enrollment was not reported.

During the 2017-19 period of this Annual Report, the CCELL continued its strong advocacy of ELL programs. In particular, it advocated for more pre-K dual language programs overall and more neighborhoods and schools with dual language programs. See further Section IV, CCELL Advocacy, below.

### III. CCELL Creation and Composition

#### State Intervention into NYC ELL Education

In 2011, NYS found that NYC had failed to adequately meet the needs of English Language Learners (ELLs). In response to a State directive, the City developed a plan to address service shortfalls that enumerated the steps the City would take to improve them. The City agreed to:

- Increase enrollment in bilingual programs;
- Increase qualified teachers;
- Hold principals more accountable for meeting plan goals;
- Reduce the number of students needing ELL services for more than six years; and
- Require that all students who needed these services be enrolled in them by 2018-2019.

The City signed a *Memorandum of Understanding* to that effect in 2014 (For the full text with public comments, see [http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/DOE\\_MOU\\_FINAL.pdf](http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/DOE_MOU_FINAL.pdf).)

#### Governance of NYC Education Programs and Policies

As an outgrowth of Mayoral control, the NYC Mayor has had direct control of NYC educational policy and programs since 2002. Mayoral control legislation abolished the former Board of Education and the 32 district Community School Boards. The Panel for Educational Policy (PEP) replaced the formerly citywide Board of Education and Community School Boards by Community Education Councils (CECs). The mayor and borough presidents appoint PEP members. Parents elect nine CEC members and the borough presidents appoint two. The Citywide Councils (High School, Special Education and English Language Learners) have nine-elected parent members and two appointed by the NYC Public Advocate. All the councils have a non-voting student member.

#### Creation of Citywide Council on English Language Learners

In 2009, New York State Education Law 2590-B, 5, established the CCELL (a) (i) – (iii) to "advise and comment on any educational or instructional policy involving bilingual or English as a second language programs, [and] to issue an annual report on the effectiveness of the city district in providing services to English language learners and making recommendations, as appropriate, on how to improve the efficiency and delivery of such services." The CCELL is to "hold at least one meeting per month open to the public, ... during which the public may discuss issues facing ELLs." The first CCELL was seated on July 1, 2010.

Under NYS State law, the NYC CCELL is composed of 11 voting members and one non-voting member, as follows:

- Nine voting parent members with children in a bilingual or ENL program or in such a program within the past two years, elected for a two-year term.

- Two voting members with extensive experience and knowledge in the education of English language learners who can make a significant contribution to improving bilingual and ENL programs appointed by the New York City Public Advocate for a two-year term.
- One non-voting high school senior member, who is or has been in a bilingual or ENL program appointed for a one-year term by the administrator designated by the New York City Department of Education Chancellor to supervise such programs.

If a parent or student member leaves the Council before his or her term has expired, the law requires that the vacancy be filled, pursuant to a process developed by the Chancellor that shall include consultation with parents of students who receive services for English language learners. When a vacancy occurs in a position appointed by the Public Advocate, the Public Advocate shall appoint a member to serve the remainder of the unexpired term.

### **Early Membership Challenges**

The founding legislation hampered CCELL efforts to seat and sustain a full complement of members because of more restrictive criteria for those eligible to serve. The first parent members of the CCELL were seated on July 1, 2010. In the following years, the CCELL did not reach a full complement of parent members. The Citywide and District Community Education Council elections held in Spring 2011 also resulted in the election of only one parent of an ELL eligible to be seated as a member of the CCELL.

In its earlier years, the CCELL found it challenging to conduct its mandated activities and advocacy because it frequently lacked a quorum as a result of restrictions on parent eligibility. Originally, parental eligibility to serve required that their children be still enrolled in an ELL public school program. Another hurdle was lack of public familiarity with options open to parent participation, compounded by the limited English proficiency of many from the ELL target community. The problem of ELL parent representation affected other community education advisory boards as well. The 32 District Community Education Councils also had difficulty seating its one legally required member from the ELL community.

In July 2013, as advocated by the CCELL, State law was amended to expand the pool of eligible parents. Subsequently, parental participation on the CCELL did not have to end following the termination of their children's ELL designation. Eligibility to serve could continue for those parents of students who had tested out of ELL programs during the past two years. As a result of the expanded pool of potential ELL parent members, the CCELL seated a full Council for the first time in 2015.

By 2015-2017 and continuing through 2017-2019, CCELL activity reflected the improved continuity and consistency resulting from fuller parent representation. These, in turn, has enabled the Council to more consistently and creatively carry out the functions and responsibilities intended by law and public policy for New York City's public school ELL population and programs.

All Council members who served for the period covered by this Annual Report were:

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>CCELL Members and Officers</b> <b>2017-2019 School Years</b> (listed as serving for 2-year terms from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2019, unless otherwise noted)</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Teresa Arboleda, President</li><li>• Hebatalla Ibrahim, 1st VP</li><li>• Nargiza Rafieva, 2nd VP</li><li>• Victor de dos Santos, Recording Secretary to June 30, 2018</li><li>• Yenny Almonte -December 5, 2017 and Recording Secretary July 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019</li><li>• Saima Arfan, Treasurer</li><li>• Osiris de la Cruz</li><li>• Kahdeidra Martin</li><li>• Mitchel Wu</li><li>• Julie Zhu</li><li>• Aisuluu Sartaeva– December 5, 2017 to August 31, 2018</li><li>• Nader Nassim--Student Member, August 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018</li><li>• Radwa Gomaa--Student Member, October 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019</li></ul>

The CCELL also appointed Ulan Kachukov representative of the Citywide Council on English Language Learners to the Citywide Council on High Schools as of August 1, 2017, serving until August 1, 2018 per Citywide Council for English Language Learners (CCELL) Resolution #26.

### **Organization and Bylaws**

Changes to State law in July 2013 has enabled the Council to fill all seats since the 2015 reporting period. As a result, during the period of this Annual Report, the Council was better positioned to increase outreach to the ELL community it serves and to those outside the immediate community impacting the formation and delivery of ELL policies, programs, and services.

From its inception, Council objectives have included establishing a committee structure to improve Council operations. In Fall 2016, the CCELL created a Bylaws Committee to revise existing bylaws. Their efforts culminated in the new set of bylaws approved on January 15, 2017 (Bylaws are posted on the CCELL website at [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org)). At its September 12, 2019 meeting, the CCELL reviewed the current Bylaws and agreed that they did not require change at that point.

### **Office Location and Administrative Support**

During the period covered by the Report, the CCELL office staffed by an administrative assistant was located at: 45-18 Court Square, room 260, Long Island City, NY 11101. The office was accessible by subway and numerous bus lines. (As of December 17, 2019, the Office was relocated to 28-11 Queens Plaza North, Long Island City).

Ms. Viviana Andino has served as administrative assistant since 2011. She has not only helped with the day-to-day operations of the Council but has also continues to maintain valuable relationships to those inside and outside the immediate community the CCELL serves. She was and continues to be available in the office from 9-5 weekdays by email at [cell@schools.nys.gov](mailto:cell@schools.nys.gov).

## IV. CCELL Advocacy

**Bilingual/Dual Language Program Expansion and Funding:** The CCELL continued its strong advocacy of ELL programs in school years 2017-2019. In particular, it advocated for more pre-K dual language programs and more neighborhoods and schools with dual language programs because of their positive impact on overall cognitive development and language learning, both native and new.

From Fall, 2015 on, there was a rapidly increasing expansion of such programs, including that from the then single pre-K program. By January 2015, NYC had announced the expansion of the City's dual language programs aimed at students speaking or wishing to learn Mandarin, French, Haitian Creole, Hebrew, Japanese, and Spanish. Dual language programs were to be added to 25 more schools and expanded at 15 schools that already had dual language classes, bringing the number of dual language programs to 177 as of September 2015. Twenty-three new programs were planned for elementary schools, thirteen for middle schools, three for high schools, and one for a K-12 school.

In April 2016, then Schools Chancellor Carmen Fariña announced creation of 38 new bilingual programs across the five boroughs for the 2016-17 school year, reflecting the DOE's commitment to increasing multilingual programs across the City. The expansion included 29 Dual Language and nine Transitional Bilingual Educational programs implemented across 36 schools and serving more than 1,200 students across the City. (Source: <http://schools.nyc.gov/Offices/mediarelations/NewsandSpeeches/2015-2016/Chancellor+Farina+Announces+38+New+Bilingual+Programs.htm>)

In January 2018, the DOE announced an additional 33 dual language pre-K programs for the coming school year, more than doubling the bilingual opportunities available for New York City's youngest learners. The 33 pre-K programs were part of 150 new bilingual programs at all levels for the 2018-2019 academic year. Included in the expansion were the City's first dual language pre-K programs in Bengali and Russian. The other additions were to build on programs in Spanish, Mandarin and Italian. (For a comprehensive overview of NYC dual language/transitional ENL programs by language, school, district, and borough, follow the link under Bilingual Programs at <https://infohub.nyced.org/in-our-schools/programs/english-language-learners-programs-and-services>.)

On May 1, 2018, the Council passed CCELL Resolution #29 Funding for Non-ELL Students in Dual Language Programs. The Resolution applauded the expansion of the announced dual language programs. However, the CCELL also called upon the City to provide added financial support for such programs, noting that schools did not receive additional funding for non-ELL designated students in dual language programs or additional funding for bilingual students, even though dual language programs incur additional costs in providing dual language bilingual education. The resolution reads in part:

“WHEREAS, Currently, there are 389 NYC Department of Education (DOE) public schools across the five boroughs that offer a total of 607 bilingual education programs in 14 foreign languages, and WHEREAS, the Dual Language model of bilingual education benefits both English Language Learners (ELLs) and those students interested in learning a foreign language, in addition to preparing them for future career opportunities

NYC DOE CCELL  
Annual Report, July 2017-June 2019

that require speaking or understanding a foreign language, and WHEREAS, due to the success of these programs and the interest of non-ELL students in enrolling in these programs, more programs in more languages are planned in the near future, and WHEREAS, while schools receive additional funding to support ELL students, schools do **not** [emphasis added] receive funding to support bilingual education for non-ELL students in dual language programs, resulting in additional financial challenges that schools must overcome, . . . WHEREAS, becoming bilingual, biliterate and culturally aware provides an advantage in obtaining meaningful employment in the global economy, and therefore be it RESOLVED, that the NYC Council annually allocate funding to the DOE that is specifically marked for funding of non-ELL students in dual language programs, which includes funding for resources, support and professional development for teachers in dual language programs in DOE managed public schools; and be it further RESOLVED, that a DOE budget allocation be established to provide resources and support for non-ELL students enrolled in dual language programs; and be it further RESOLVED, that a DOE budget allocation be established to support additional remuneration for certified dual language teachers actively teaching a dual language class; and be it further RESOLVED, that the budget process be transparent and offer an opportunity for the parents, students and advocates of dual language programs to provide pertinent input into the process.”

**DACA/Dream Act and Other Programs Impacting Services for ELL Students:** In addition, the Council continued to support previous changes to State and City programs and services for all NYC students with impact on the well-being of ELL students, families, and other stakeholders. These changes included universal free lunch programs and distribution of information about parent and student educational rights under State law documented in the CCELL 2015-2017 Annual Report (The text of all Annual Reports can be found on the CCELL website at: [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org)).

On October 3, 2017, it passed Resolution 28 In Support of DACA/Dream Act. The Resolution supported proposed Federal and State legislation and policy for DACA students, including access to higher education. The Resolution noted the large percentage of ELL students in the NYC public school system. According to DOE data, 33% or more of ELLs in the 2015-2016 school year had been born outside of the United States, increasing the likelihood that an unknown number were inevitably undocumented through no fault of their own. During the Spring 2019 session the NYS Legislature approved the DACA/Dream Act. The resolution reads in part:

”Whereas, the NYCDOE 2015-16 School Year English Language Learner Demographics Report (the Report) states that 138,207 students in the NYC school system have been identified as English Language Learners (ELLs) which account for 14.36% of the entire NYCDOE population of 962,610 students (excluding charter schools); and Whereas, according to the Report, 33,39% of ELLs were born outside the United States of America, representing a significant proportion of the total NYC ELL Student population; and Whereas, here is no hard data on the number of undocumented students in NYC schools, it is logical to expect that many ELLs who are foreign born or new immigrants will be undocumented and that they were brought to this country by their parents at an age where they were unaware of their status; and . . . Whereas, the CCELL advocates for equal access to higher education for all students, whether or not they are undocumented; and now therefore, be it Resolved, that the CCELL fully supports Federal and New York State DREAM Act legislation that will ensure equal access to higher education for all students, regardless of immigration status, provide financial resources from both the public and the private sectors, and make available tax-free education accounts for undocumented students to help their families plan for college; and be it further Resolved, that that the CCELL fully supports Federal and NY State DREAM Act legislation so that the great untapped potential of undocumented youth will have the opportunity to make valuable economic and social contributions to United States and NY State; and be it further Resolved, that that the CCELL fully supports federal legislation (Senate Bill S1625 and House Bill HR3440) that would automatically grant conditional permanent resident status to DACA recipients who still meet the requirements needed to obtain DACA.”

## V. Building Connections: Communication and Outreach

Communication and outreach continued to be one of the CCELLs three major goals affirmed in the 2013-2015 Strategic Plan and the June 2019 Plan Update. (See the CCELL website for the original Plan and the Plan Update).

The 2015-2017 Annual Report documents three ways that the Council had implemented specific strategies to enhance communication and outreach:

- By voicing support for more citywide translation and interpreting services;
- By implementing more digital, social media, and other outreach and promotion activities; and
- By fostering more extensive relationships with and to others in the ELL community and beyond.

During 2017-2019, the Council continued to support and enhance these initiatives.

### Translation and Interpretation Services, Strategies, and Implementation

In its 2013-2015 Annual Report, the CCELL had recommended that meetings, events, and policies of interest to ELL parents be provided in languages spoken by ELL parents. In September 2015, the CCELL passed Resolution 20, *The Need for Interpretation/Translation Services for Citywide and District Education Councils*. The Resolution called for interpreting and translations services that would enable Council members to better carry out their duties and responsibilities and would help Limited English-Speaking parents to participate more knowledgeably and more widely in their children's education.

The NYC Department of Education Division of Family and Community Empowerment (FACE) has cooperated with and supported the CCELL in its efforts to reach out to parents. The DOE Translation and Interpretation Unit now provides Spanish translation at every CCELL meeting. The Translation and Interpretation unit offers translation services in Arabic, Bengali, Chinese, French, Haitian Creole, Korean, Russian, Spanish, and Urdu.

The CCELL continued to monitor the DOE translation policy and its implementation. Specifically, following the February 13, 2018 presentation on IEP Translation presentation given by Kleber Palma, Director of Translation & Interpretation Unit CCELL meeting, the Council pointed out that Chancellor's Regulation A663 – Translation had not been updated since 2009 and should be updated.

### CCELL Digital Outreach—Website and Social Media

The CCELL has maintained a website ([www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org)) since early 2012 to make information about its purpose and activities readily available to the public. The website provides information about the Council's purpose, history, and activity and provides updated information about Council members, meetings, events, resolution, and documents. The Council also maintains a Facebook page (CCELL-Citywide Council on English Language Learners).

In September 2015, the CCELL began updating its website and social media pages. Council members report that the Facebook page has received several “likes” since then.



### **CCELL Logo and Other Promotion**

In 2015-2017, the CCELL worked to promote recognition and identity through print and other distribution materials. In December 2015, it approved a new logo for business cards, letterhead, and other Council communications. In February 2016, it reallocated certain unexpended budget funds to purchase identifying memorabilia such as member polo shirts and pens and flashlights for outreach distribution. The CCELL had hard copies of the 2013-2015 and 2015-2017 Annual Reports printed professionally. It also made them available and continues to make them available electronically on its website.

### **Connecting to Others by Fostering Council Relationships with The Community**

In 2017-2019, the CCELL continued to build connections to those within the ELL community it serves as well as to those outside it. In addition to the more immediate community of ELL parents, students, and educators, it sustained necessary and fruitful connections to other official NYC elected and appointed bodies influencing educational programs and policies with direct or indirect bearing on ELL programs and policies. It did so in two ways:

- (1) By Council representation at and participation in their meetings and events and
- (2) By Council invitation for their reciprocal representation and anticipation at CCELL activities such as its monthly meetings.

The CCELL has had to find an appropriate balance between the times it needs to spend within the community it serves and the time spent cultivating relationships outside its immediate community to advance its mission and goals.

**Relationships with Elected and Appointed Officials and Other Official Bodies:** In 2017-2019, it continued to reach beyond the target community to foster relationships with elected and appointed officials and bodies. These included but were not limited to the Public Advocate, the NYC Department of Education Chancellor and staff, and the other official councils such as the Citywide Council on High Schools (CCHS), the Citywide Council on Special Education (CCSE), D75, District Community Education Councils, the Chancellor's Parent Advisory Education Council (CPAC), and the Panel for Educational Policy (PEP) (a replacement for the former Board of Education with the advent of Mayoral control).

In addition, the CCELL President and/or other representatives regularly attended and reported back to the Council about external meetings, such as those of the Educational Council Consortium (an external group representing all citywide and district education councils).

Also, as Council minutes record, the President and/or other CCELL representatives regularly attended meetings such as those with the Public Advocate's Office, with Citywide Education Councils, and with the PEP. It maintained relationships with groups sharing common ELL interests. As examples of participation with groups sharing common ELL interests, the CCELL in Fall 2017 held joint meetings with the Citywide Council of High Schools about ways to improve ELL participation and success in the specialized high school admissions process. Both Councils sought to address the comparatively low percentage of ELLs passing the specialized high school test.

The CCELL also held joint meetings with the Citywide Council on Special Education where the needs of students identified as needing services in English Language Learning and in Special Education were discussed. The presentations included how to identify indications of learning disability and the level of English proficiency. The issue of translation of Individual Education Plans (IEPs) was also discussed, including updates of the NYCDOE Translation and Interpretation Unit pilot program in three districts to provide translations of IEPs.

The CCELL continued to strengthen strategies building on earlier initiatives to increase representation at and participation in CCELL meetings from those outside the target community such as from other Citywide Councils, from schools, and from the Department of Education on matters concerning the ELL community. The Table of Presentations below and CCELL meeting minutes document the diversity of external participation in CCELL meetings. As well, CCELL minutes reflect systematic reports from members who have attended other Citywide Council and DOE meetings.

To maintain a direct connection between the CCELL community and the NYC DOE, the Council maintained regular contact with the Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS), (now the Division of Multilingual Learners/DML) which has direct responsibility for English language learner programs and services. The DESS/DML representatives regularly attended monthly public meetings of the CCELL to provide information and guidance to the members and attendees.

Maintaining a strong working relationship with the DESS/DML was and has continued to be vital to the work of the CCELL. At CCELL meetings, the DESS provided and the

DML continued to provide periodic updates on DOE progress in meeting the goals set by the 2014 *Memorandum of Understanding* with the State Education Department. It continued and continues to offer parent workshops in every borough and provides information on ELL program choices in nine languages. In addition, the DELLSS/DML interfaces with the Citywide Council on High Schools and the Citywide Council on Special Education on issues connected to the work of the CCELL.

**Presentations of Others to the CCELL, 2017-2019**

The CCELL structures most monthly meetings to include presentations by representatives from outside the CCELL of interest to families of ELLs, teachers and staff, and members. Meetings are typically divided into two parts, an open public calendar meeting at which members of the public can address the Council and a business session, also open to the public but without comments. Presentations are made typically during the CCELL’s calendar meetings and open to members of the public. The following table highlights presentations made in the period covered by this report as well as a March 2019 Town Hall meeting with Chancellor Richard Carranza.

Although non-voting, the student representative, a high school senior, attends all meetings and fully participates in Council meetings like any other member. In addition, the student representative is expected to make a public presentation on a topic related to the Council’s mission near the end of their respective terms. This provides an opportunity for young people still in secondary school to develop important public presentation and communication skills:

<b>Presentations and Town Hall Meeting Selected Representative List</b>
<b>Town Hall Meeting with Chancellor Richard Carranza</b>
Chancellor Carranza welcomed everyone and affirmed his support for Multilingual Education since he is a former ELL. Following his remarks, Teresa Arboleda, President of CCELL, and Members conducted a Q&A with questions developed by the CCELL members, parents in the audience of the March 5 CCELL meeting, and parents from schools. Audience members also had the opportunity to ask the Chancellor questions (3/12/19).
<b>NYCDOE Translation and Interpretation Unit Staff</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Translation and Interpretation services available to Councils, schools, and families (8/1/17).</li> <li>• IEP Translation Pilot in Districts 9, 24 and 75 (11/13/18).</li> </ul>
<b>Other DOE Offices</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Career and Technical Education presentation by Office of Postsecondary Readiness, Career and Technical Education (CTE) (5/1/18).</li> <li>• ELLs and High School Admission Process including Specialized High Schools by Vikram Cheema, Project Manager and Lida Roman, Director of the High School Admissions, Strategy and Policy (9/12/18).</li> <li>• STEM and ELLs by Miguel Cordero, Director of Secondary Mathematics/STEM and Dionisio Rodriguez, Director of Elementary Mathematics/STEM (12/4/18).</li> </ul>

<b>Education Council Consortium</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ellen McHugh, Co-Founder of ECC and a CCSE member spoke about how the Education Council Consortium was established before the election of the current mayor by a group of citywide and district Community Education Councils, the purpose of the ECC, and how the ECC works (8/1/17).</li> </ul>
<b>Citywide Education Council Members</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CCSE Presentation on IEP Conference – May 5, 2018, by Ellen McHugh, President of the Citywide Council on Special Education.</li> </ul>
<b>CCELL Student Council Members (2017-2018 and 2018-2019 Terms)</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nadar Nassim, CCELL Student Representative on How CTE Programs Support English Language Learners (5/1/18).</li> <li>• Radwa Gomaa, CCELL Student Representative on Struggles of English Language Learners in Middle and High School (5/7/19)</li> </ul>
<b>US Department of Education</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The English Learners, Newcomers and ELL Parent Toolkits Special Focus Group conducted by Jose Viana, Assistant Deputy Secretary and Director of the Office English Language Acquisition of the US Department of Education, and by Jobi Lawrence, English Language Learners: Title III Transition for Success requesting parent input on the best interests of their children, the interest of parents to get more information from schools and more programs for parents and children (12/5/17).</li> </ul>
<b>Community Organizations</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Oriana Rosado, NYIC Community Engagement VISTA and Kemah George, Manager of Community Engagement, NY Immigration Coalition on DACA (1/9/18). Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) (1/9/18).</li> <li>• Karen Watts, Superintendent of Brooklyn High Schools, and Comfort Itoka, District representative of Brooklyn North Family Support Center presentation on 2018-2019 Budget and Fair Student Funding (3/10/18).</li> <li>• Christina Samuels, Manager of Education Policy of the New York Immigration Coalition on Information on Unaccompanied Youth and Education Issues by (NYIC) (11/13/18).</li> </ul>

**Presentations by CCELL Members to Others in The Communities They Serve**

Above all, the CCELL members continued to fulfill a commitment to speak for and to the community they serve about topics related to English language learning. As citywide Community Education Council, the CCELL service area is all of New York City. The multilingual community consists of others besides students—parents, community groups, school educators, etc. As individual spokespeople, CCELL members continued to represent the CCELL by engaging with parents, parent and community groups, and schools and educators throughout NYC.

For example, during the period covered by this Annual Report, individual CCELL members undertook the following representative activities in their communities:

**CCELL Member Engagement in The Community  
Selected Representative List**

- Attended meetings of their local district educational councils (CECs) and provided information to parents in attendance.
- Participated in school events such as fairs, where they conveyed information to the school community about their rights to a bilingual education for their children to learn English.
- Presented information at PTA meetings on such programs as Summer in the City; Pre-K enrollment and available resources for ELLs.
- Attended CEC committee meetings to address parents regarding local ELL education issues and to provide assistance to parents about how to work with the DOE in expanding dual language programs.
- Informed parents of ELLs in the local districts about meetings, town halls, conferences and any events available to them.
- Informed parents as to the availability, usually free of charge, of adult training, GED programs, citizenship classes, and immigrants' rights.
- Established relationships with local and state elected officials and advocated for and/or testified for legislation in support of bilingual education, including funding, at the local and state levels.

## **VI. Professional Development: Education and Training**

From the initial Strategic Plan to the 2019 Update, the CCELL has identified member and staff education and training as one of its three major Strategic Plan goals. In 2017-2019, the CCELL dedicated significant attention to member and staff education and training.

### **Education Initiatives**

Education on topics of interest to the CCELL members and community occurred regularly via monthly meeting presentations made by representatives from the NYC Department of Education such as those documented in the Table of Presentations, above. These included but were not limited to presentations from the NYC Department of Education representatives such as NYCDOE Division of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) and from schools with large ELL populations and programs.

### **Training Initiatives**

The CCELL also encouraged its members to access training, especially that provided by the Department of Education Division of Family and Community Engagement (FACE) for Citywide Council and CEC members and/or staff.

As reflected in CCELL minutes, the CCELL President and/or Administrative Assistant Andino routinely provided information about upcoming training sessions at nearly every Council meeting. Council members were mandated to attend at least two training sessions an academic year.

## VII. Strategic Planning and Recommendations

Based on the results of its 2015-2017 activities, the CCELL experienced an improved ELL environment in 2017-2019 following changes in the State law and City commitment to the expansion of ELL programs and services. The CCELL was able to sustain a productive Council membership now that membership stability and continuity had improved in response to changes in the State law.

Still, the Council membership continued to face competing demands on its collective and individuals' time and energy to fulfill its mission and carry out its duties and responsibilities by engaging with:

- Those within the immediate community it serves, including parents, teachers, and others; and
- Those outside the Council such as State and City officials, and the Department of Education staff who create the policies and/or implement the programs and services that directly impact ELL students.

### Strategic Planning

By 2019, the CCELL had existed for almost 10 years with a record and history documented in this and previous Annual Reports. (The Reports for 2011-13, 2013-2015, and 2015-2017 are available on the CCELL website at: [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org)).

In 2015, the Council completed a comprehensive Strategic Plan. It updated the Strategic Plan in June 2019. The 2019 update articulated several specific strategies and timelines going forward to fulfill the CCELL's ongoing mission, goals, and objectives, in addition to those in the original Plan. The 2019 Update included other implementation strategies and timelines such as:

#### **For Goal 1: Enhance CCELL Organization and Structure:**

- Expansion of "committee membership at the Council's discretion to include former Council members and other members of the community with demonstrated expertise and interest in committee matters."
- Review and assess implementation of outcomes of Strategic Plan goals and objectives at mid-point of each Council year "to strengthen implementation activities as needed" and assess outcomes annually as part of the Annual Plan.

#### **For Goal 2: Enhance CCELL Communication and Outreach**

- Including profiles of current and former Council members on the website for general information and to stimulate interest in becoming a Council member.
- Defining common acronyms used in education laws, regulations, and Department of Education publications to help parents and other members of the public understand such information.

- Soliciting time pro bono on non-English language radio programs and/or space in local newspapers for Council information and announcements.

**For Goal 3: Enhance CCELL Professional Development:**

- Including professional development activities from the external multilingual community besides DOE staff on issues and trends in ENL, dual language, and other topics of concern to the Council and community.

**Recommendations**

Threaded throughout this Report are recommendations based on CCELL discussions, assessments, and reviews. Many of these recommendations involve resources and participation of others, including City and State entities. To cite some examples, the CCELL should continue to seek:

- Demographic data refinements in areas such as ENL postsecondary participation rates and break out of the “other” category of ENL learners described above and
- Interpretation and translation services in areas of concern to ELL parents and educators.

## **VIII. Ten Years: Representing the Multilingual Community**

This Report covers the work of the CCELL for academic years 2017-2019. Implicit in the Report is the nearly 10-year history of the Council's growth, evolution, and achievements. The finite period of 2017-2019 has built upon the work of previous Councils to reach a point of stable membership, to solidify constructive relationships with other public agencies and representatives, and, above all, to emerge as a strong voice for the multilingual community it serves.

To measure that progress, readers and future Council members are encouraged to review the Annual Reports for those formative years as well posted on the CCELL website: [www.ccell.org](http://www.ccell.org).

## Attachment A: Memorandum of Understanding



### Memorandum of Understanding

between

The New York City Department of Education

and

The New York State Education Department

This Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) sets forth the terms and understanding between the two parties above in order to enhance programs and services for English Language Learners.

#### Background

DOE is committed to working to improve educational opportunities for all English language learners (ELL), to ensure that students have access to rigorous Common Core-aligned instruction and the full range of educational opportunities within the DOE. The DOE serves approximately 160,000 students identified as ELLs who speak over 160 different languages. ELLs face the challenge of learning a second language while simultaneously acquiring content area skills and concepts. School communities serving ELLs must be supported in strengthening the specialized skill sets necessary to effectively address the academic and linguistic needs of NYC's diverse ELL student population.

#### Purpose

In New York City, ELL educational services and programs are guided by New York State Education Department Commissioner's Regulations (CR) Part 154, which provides the basic requirements and procedures for ELL education. CR Part 154, as amended by the Aspira Consent Decree, requires schools to form bilingual education programs in grades K-8 when there are 15 or more ELLs of the same language in two contiguous grades, and in grades 9-12 when there are 20 or more ELLs in any single grade. CR Part 154 also determines the number of English as a New Language (ENL, formerly known as ESL) instructional units which ELLs must receive according to their levels of English proficiency. The school system's goal of aligning ELL programs with CR Part 154 ensures that ELLs acquire and develop English language skills while meeting the standards that are expected at their grade and age levels in core subjects.

The DOE is committed to strengthening all ELL programs, including establishing and expanding existing bilingual programs when thresholds are met, as evidenced by the increase in fiscal and personnel resources that will be utilized to support schools.

The DOE looks forward to the collaborative efforts with NYS Education Department as it accelerates the achievement for all ELLs and sets the bar high for the State and the rest of the nation. Specifically, this MOU demonstrates the ongoing commitment to enhancing and improving the following areas, which are described within this MOU.

- A. Programs and services for all ELLs
- B. Identification processes and placement of ELLs and parent information
- C. Staffing of ELL programs
- D. Accountability procedures and reporting capabilities

#### Duration

This MOU may be modified by mutual consent of authorized officials from the NYCDOE and the NYSED. This MOU shall become effective upon signature by the authorized officials from the above listed parties and will remain in effect until June 30, 2018. The attached plan with specific, measurable, assignable, results-oriented, and timely goals put forth by NYSED will be implemented by NYCDOE over this period of time, therefore meeting the agreement of the MOU as a testament to our mutual commitment to English Language Learners. Targets and goals have been developed to afford NYCDOE flexibility in implementation.

#### Contact Information

New York City Department of Education  
Carmen Fariña, Chancellor  
Department of English Language Learners and Student Support  
52 Chambers Street, room 320  
New York City, NY 10007

and

New York State Education Department  
Dr. John B. King, Jr., Commissioner of Education  
89 Washington Avenue  
Albany, New York 12234

The two parties below agree to the above Memorandum of Understanding on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of November in the year 2014.

Signatures:

---

Carmen Fariña, Chancellor

---

Dr. John B. King, Jr., Commissioner of Education



THE STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT / THE UNIVERSITY OF THE STATE  
OF NEW YORK / ALBANY, NY 12234

---

Office of Bilingual Education and Foreign Language Studies

89 Washington Avenue  
55 Hanson Place

Room 528 EB  
Albany, NY 12234

5<sup>th</sup> Floor, Room 594  
Brooklyn, NY 11217  
Tel. 718-722-2445 Fax 518-474-7948

Tel. 518-474-8775  
Fax 718-722-2459

## NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AREAS OF FOCUS FOR ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

### OVERVIEW OF FOCUS AREAS:

A. Programs and Services for English Language Learners (ELLs) B. Identification and Placement of ELLs and Parent Information C. Certified Teachers and Staffing D. Accountability

As of the 2015-2016 school year, the plan should be in alignment with the recently adopted Commissioner's Regulation Part 154.

### A. PROGRAMS AND SERVICES FOR ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNERS

*NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:*

A.1) High quality Bilingual Education programs (Transitional and Dual Language) geared towards English Language Learners (ELLs) are created in a variety of school models (e.g., themed schools) to meet the needs of all ELL language groups, and expand availability of programs, with priority given to underserved languages and school districts.

- Goal: Increase ELL participation in Bilingual Education programs by 25% each year, such that programs are available for all eligible ELLs by 2018-2019.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #8 and #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

A.2) Admissions policies for new, small, and specialized schools provide for the full participation of English Language Learners.

- Goal: Demonstrate an overall 5% incremental gain in ELL enrollment each year from 2015-2016 to 2017-2018, in each of the above named types of schools, to ensure ELL representation is comparable to the citywide percentage of ELLs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.2 and the above mentioned goal.

A.3) Each high school meets designated ELL enrollment targets, based on a formula which takes into account the number of ELL students in each Community School District or geographic area, such that each school's ELL enrollment is reflective of the number of ELLs in the community school district.

- Goal: Meet the designated enrollment such that 50% of all high schools will meet their designated ELL enrollment targets for the class entering in the 2015-2016 school year. During the 2016-2017 school year, demonstrate that 100% of high schools meet their designated ELL enrollment targets.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.3 and the above mentioned goal.

A.4) CTE, YABC, and D79 programs provide high quality Bilingual and/or ESL instruction to all ELLs.

- Goal: Demonstrate that CTE, YABC, and D79 programs are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support (DELLSS) to ensure that 100% of programs provide ESL instruction at a minimum.
- Goal: Demonstrate that CTE, YABC, and D79 programs are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure Bilingual Education programs are provided, such that 25% of programs monitored in 2014-2015 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, 50% of monitored in 2015-2016 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, 75% monitored in 2016-2017 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language, and 100% in 2017-2018 provide Bilingual Education programs if they have the threshold number of ELL students who share a home language.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.4 and the above mentioned goal.

A.5) Procedures are in place to improve the continuity of Bilingual Education and ESL programs provided to ELLs across all school districts and grade levels.

- Goal: Reduce by 25% the number of ELLs who did not have access to program continuity in 2015-2016, 2016-2017, and 2017-2018, such that all ELLs will have access to Bilingual Education and ESL program continuity by 2018-2019.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.5 and the above mentioned goal.

A.6) Procedures are in place to improve the quality of Bilingual Education and ESL programs provided to ELLs across all school districts and grade levels in alignment with the Blueprint for ELL Success.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they meet established criteria for high quality Bilingual Education and ESL programs aligned to the Blueprint for ELL Success, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide

high quality programs, and 90%-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide high quality programs.

- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.6, Auditor General's Recommendation #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

A.7) ELLs with Individualized Education Programs (IEPs) are provided Bilingual Education and/or ESL services that address their linguistic, academic, and social-emotional needs and enable these students to acquire proficiency in English while having meaningful access to grade level curriculum.

- Goal: Increase the availability of Bilingual Education programs and ESL services that meet the needs of ELLs with IEPs by 25%, such that by 2018-2019, all ELLs with IEPs receive Bilingual Education / ESL services that address their linguistic, academic, and social-emotional needs to acquire language and academic proficiency.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.7 and the above mentioned goal.

A.8) Increase the number of ELLs exiting from ELL status within 6 years and ensure that Long Term ELLs (LTEs) receive high quality education in Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs.

- Goal: Increase by 5% in 2015-2016 and each subsequent year through 2018-2019 the number of ELLs exiting from ELL status within 6 years, by focusing on schools that generate consistent numbers of developing ELLs. Also, demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they meet established criteria for high quality Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide programs, and 90%-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide programs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.8 and the above mentioned goal.

A.9) Ensure that Students with Interrupted Formal Education (SIFE) receive high quality education in Bilingual Education and/or ESL programs that target their academic, language and socio-emotional needs.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure they provide appropriate Bilingual Education and /or ESL programs to SIFE, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide programs and instruction, and 90-100% of schools monitored in 2016-2017 provide programs and instruction.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item A.9 and the above mentioned goal.

## B. IDENTIFICATION / PLACEMENT OF ELLS AND PARENT INFORMATION

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

B.1) Centralized locations are established in each borough's Enrollment Office where families of ELL newcomers are provided with accurate, objective, and complete information regarding ELL program options and parental rights in their home languages.

- Goal: Establish a centralized ELL Enrollment Office location in each borough in time for the enrollment process for the 2015-2016 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #1 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.2) NYCDOE Department of English Language Learners and Student Support and the Enrollment Office staff collaborate in the provision of comprehensive training about ELL program options, Part 154 regulations, the ELL identification process, and parents' rights, including accessibility to interpretation and translation services. In addition, Enrollment Office staff has access to all current Bilingual Education Program (Transitional and Dual Language) information available in order to timely inform parents.

- Goal: Demonstrate that enrollment center staff is provided with comprehensive Bilingual Education information, program availability, enrollment information, and professional development in the above B.2 topics, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- Goal: Create and implement a series of ongoing professional development sessions each year for Enrollment Office staff on each of the topics outlined in B.2.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.2 and the above mentioned goals.

B.3) Qualified personnel adhere to the ELL identification and placement process, consistent with the regulatory timeframe that identification be completed at time of enrollment and within ten (10) school days of the student's enrollment - regardless of the time of year. The process includes administration of the Home Language Questionnaire to the parent or person in parental relation, interview of the student and the parent conducted in English and the home language, administration of the NYSITELL to the student to determine English language proficiency, and placement of the student in an appropriate Bilingual Education and/or ESL program in which the student receives the required units of study pursuant to CR Part 154. The ELL identification and placement process includes clear and efficient protocols to address situations where students are not enrolled by the first school to which they are assigned.

- Goal: Create and implement a series of ongoing professional development sessions each year for cluster, network, enrollment, and school staff, in order to reinforce the ELL Identification and Placement process.
- Goal: Train/retrain 50% of aforementioned staff in 2015-2016, and the remaining 50% in 2016-2017, such that all staff is trained/retrained by the end of the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.3, Auditor General's Recommendation #9 contained in the ELL Parent

Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

B.4) Parents or other person in parental relation of a student designated as an ELL are provided a high quality orientation session on the state standards, assessments, and school expectations for ELLs, as well as the program goals and requirements for Bilingual Education and English as a Second Language, as prescribed by CR Part 154 and in their home languages.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure high quality orientation sessions are provided, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2015-2016 provide high quality orientation sessions, and 90% - 100% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2016-2017 provide high quality orientation sessions.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.4, Auditor General's Recommendations #1, #3 and #5 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.5) Parents of ELLs are given the required opportunity to exercise their right to place their child in Bilingual Education programs in schools where the number of ELL students speaking the same home language in the same grade require such a program. NYCDOE implements a process, with appropriate interventions, to ensure that parental notifications, orientations, and ELL specific bi-annual meetings – all in parents' home languages – are implemented as required by CR Part 154.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that parents of ELLs are provided with the opportunity to place their child in a Bilingual Education program in schools where warranted, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.5, Auditor General's Recommendations #2, #3 and #5 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.6) In schools where CR Part 154 does not require the establishment of a Bilingual Education program, ELL parents are given the option of transferring their child to a school within the community school district where an appropriate Bilingual Education program exists, or outside the community school district if a Bilingual Education program does not exist within the district.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that ELL parents are given the option of transferring their child to a school within the community school district where an appropriate Bilingual Education program exists, or outside the community school district if a Bilingual

Education program does not exist within the district, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016 provide the transfer option, and 90%-100% of monitored in 2016-2017 provide the transfer option.

- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.6 and the above mentioned goal.

B.7) Each school maintains records of signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation that indicate program selection. Each school maintains records of orientation session agendas and sign in sheets for such orientations. Signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation that indicate program selection shall be included in the student's cumulative record. Signed notices of parents and persons in parental relation are in their home languages.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that all necessary documents pertaining to program selection and orientation are maintained in each ELL student's cumulative record, such that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.7, Auditor General's Recommendations #1, #3 and #7 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

B.8) Schools and each borough Enrollment Office provide parents of ELLs and other persons in parental relation with information about all Bilingual Education and English as a Second Language programs available in the community school district in the language or mode of communication that parents best understand. Schools also provide information and notices regarding program placement and the rights of such parents or persons in parental relation. Forms of mass communication are used to inform parents about programs and services for ELLs. This information includes communications regarding Bilingual Education program closings and openings, placement, parent orientations, bi-annual meetings with parents, and availability of documents in the home language.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are providing ELL parents with translated Bilingual Education and/or ESL program and placement materials, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet goals.
- Goal: Demonstrate that all information contained in B.8 is appropriately and accurately translated at a minimum in the 9 most common languages in NYC. In the event that the 9 most common languages in NYC do not include the 3 most common languages in the borough or community school district of the enrollment center, all information contained in B.8 should also be appropriately and accurately translated into those 3 most common languages of the borough or community school district.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.8, Auditor General's Recommendation #4 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

B.9) Interpretation to meet the needs of parents and persons in parental relation to ELLs and translation of materials (e.g., enrollment materials, admissions applications, outreach fairs, school meetings and materials, IEP meetings, IEPs, programs available) by qualified translators.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are providing interpretation and translation services to ELL parents, such that 50% monitored in 2015-2016, and 90%-100% of monitored in 2016-2017 meet goals.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.9 and the above mentioned goal.

B.10) Community-based organizations have a meaningful opportunity to participate in the development and creation of effective and sustainable ELL programs and services within the community.

- Goal: Hold quarterly school meetings with community-based organizations during planning time for programs for the 2015-2016 school year. The first meeting should occur in fall 2015.  
Quarterly meetings continue for the subsequent school years for the duration of this plan.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item B.10 and the above mentioned goal.

## C. CERTIFIED TEACHERS AND STAFFING

*NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:*

C.1) Teachers servicing ELLs are appropriately certified pursuant to Part 80 and Part 154 of Commissioner's Regulations.

- Goal: Ensure that the number of teachers providing ESL or Bilingual Education without appropriate certification is reduced by 25% by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, 50% by the end of the 2016-2017 school year, 75% by the end of the 2017-2018 school year and 100% by the end of the 2018-2019 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.1, and the above mentioned goal.

C.2) As prescribed by the IEPs for ELLs, qualified bilingual teachers, speech pathologists, reading specialists, and other support personnel provide high quality Bilingual and Special Education services to students in their home language. In instances when Bilingual Education programs cannot be provided for ELLs with an IEP, a bilingual paraprofessional is provided as a temporary service solution only.

- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs with IEPs being served by qualified bilingual professionals as opposed to bilingual paraprofessionals each year by 25%, such that, by the end of 2018-2019, all ELLs with IEPs are served by qualified bilingual professionals when their IEPs require.

- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs with IEPs being served according to their IEP by 25% each year, such that by the end of 2017-2018 all ELLs with IEPs are served according to their IEPs.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.2, and the above mentioned goals.

C.3) Reduces the shortage of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers in specific language groups by developing and implementing a recruitment plan for attracting Bilingual Education, ESL, and Bilingual Special Education teachers. The plan creates incentives and pathways to secure appropriately certified candidates to ELL-specific teaching positions and increase the pool of bilingual psychologists and bilingual speech teachers.

- Goal: Reduce the shortage of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers in specific language groups by 25% each school year, based on the shortages in the 2014-2015 school year and thereafter, such that by the end of the 2018-2019 school year there are no shortages of Bilingual Education / ESL teachers.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.3, and the above mentioned goal.

C.4) Aligns ELL professional development programs with the NYS Common Core Learning Standards (CCLS), New Language Arts Progressions (NLAP), Home Language Arts Progressions (HLAP), and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success. Research-based professional development is targeted to Bilingual, ESL, and content area teachers.

- Goal: Provide ELL-specific research-based professional development opportunities aligned to CCLS, NLAP, HLAP and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success to satisfy 50% of each Bilingual / ESL teacher's, and 15% of each content area teacher's professional development.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.4 and the above mentioned goal.

C.5) In schools where ELLs are not served or are partially served, consistent with collective bargaining agreements, Bilingual and ESL teachers in the district are used to provide ELL instruction aligned to NYS Common Core Learning Standards (CCLS), New Language Arts Progressions (NLAP) and NYSED's Blueprint for ELL Success, rather than assigned to non-instructional tasks.

- Goals: Demonstrate that schools are strategically monitored by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to ensure that, in schools where ELLs are underserved based on data from the 2014-2015 school year, Bilingual and ESL teachers spend the majority of their time providing instruction to ELL students' services in lieu of other non-instructional tasks. Ensure that 50% of schools monitored in 2015-2016, and 90% - 100% monitored in 2016-2017 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.5, and the above mentioned goal.

C.6) Staff in schools who are struggling to meet the instructional and programmatic needs of ELLs, based on, but not limited to, inability to meet Annual Measurable Achievement Objective (i.e., below average ELL graduation rates), attend research-based professional development to meet the needs of the ELLs.

- Goal: Provide ongoing ELL-specific research-based professional development opportunities aligned to the specific needs of identified schools, such that 80% of staff receives training annually.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item C.6, and the above mentioned goal.

## D. ACCOUNTABILITY

NYCDOE develops a plan and monitors it to ensure that:

D.1) Ensures that annual Language Allocation Policy (LAP) Reports are submitted every year prior to the end of the school year and in accordance with the NYSED submission schedule.

- Goal: Submit Language Allocation Policy (LAP) Reports for 100% of schools in all NYCDOE districts and schools prior to each school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.1, Auditor General's Recommendation #10 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goals.

D.2) Ensures that a process and reporting structure is in place to prevent schools from declining to admit potential ELLs during general and over the counter/walk-in enrollment.

- Goal: Demonstrate that schools and enrollment centers are strategically monitored by DELLSS to ensure that schools do not decline to admit ELLs during enrollment and over the counter / walk-in potential ELLs, such that 50% of schools and enrollment centers monitored in 20142015, and 90% - 100 % monitored in 2015-2016 meet expectations.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.2, and the above mentioned goal.

D.3) Develops and implements a system, consistent with collective bargaining agreements, to hold teachers, principals, and superintendents accountable for ELL programs and services, including the incorporation of ELL compliance measures in teacher, principal, and superintendent performance reviews.

- Goal: Include ELL-specific criteria in each performance review system to hold principals accountable for ELL programs and services, including the incorporation of ELL compliance measures in teacher, principal, and superintendent performance reviews.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.3, Auditor General's Recommendation #11 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.4) Designs and establishes a system to monitor over-referrals of ELLs to the Committee on Special Education (CSE) while ensuring that those referred to CSE for an individual

evaluation are provided with evaluations in each student's home language and in English pursuant to section 200.4(b)(6) of the Regulations of the Commissioner of Education.

- Goal: Provide annual ongoing professional development to schools identified as having above average referral rates of ELLs to the CSE to ensure that ELLs are appropriately referred.
- Goal: Ensure that 75% of ELLs referred to the CSE for an individual evaluation are provided with evaluations in a timely manner in each student's home language and in English in 2015-2016, and 100% for each subsequent school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.4, and the above mentioned goals.

D.5) Prior year data is used to provide support to schools that have demonstrated difficulty or a pattern of not being able to conduct timely administration of the NYSITELL.

- Goal: Increase the number of new ELLs who are timely administered the NYSITELL such that 98% are tested by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, and 99%-100% by the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.5, Auditor General's Recommendation #6 contained in the ELL Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.6) Prior year data is used to provide support to schools that have demonstrated difficulty in administering the NYSESLAT to all ELLs.

- Goal: Increase the number of ELLs who are administered the NYSESLAT such that 97% are tested by the end of the 2015-2016 school year, and 99% by the 2016-2017 school year.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.6, and the above mentioned goal.

D.7) Ensures current and future system wide and district level structures adequately support the implementation of this plan, and secures additional resources as necessary for full implementation.

- Goal: Include a designated ELL point person in charge of ensuring NYCDOE Areas of Focus for English Language Learners is met in all current and future system-wide structures.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.7, and the above mentioned goal.

D.8) Provides ELL program data that is collected during the enrollment process via the initial enrollment screen, and applied to school and Bilingual Education program placement.

- Goal: Demonstrate use of ELL program information collected via the initial enrollment screen to ensure adequate Bilingual program placement in schools, such that 80% of students are appropriately placed in Bilingual Education programs in 2015-2016, 90% in 2016-2017 and 100% in 2017-2018.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.8, Auditor General's Recommendation #7 contained in the ELL

Parent Choice Program Compliance Audit Report dated 12/19/2012, and the above mentioned goal.

D.9) Takes conceptual consolidation of funds into account, creates a monitoring system to track program implementation and ELL supports, and ensures that funds from ELL grants are used toward providing programs and instruction to ELLs.

- Goal: Create a system to strategically monitor by the Department of English Language Learners and Student Support to determine how funding is allocated in schools, and if funds are being appropriately utilized to meet the needs of their ELL students.
- NYCDOE will create and submit a plan to be reviewed and approved by NYSED to address item D.9, and the above mentioned goal.